

OPINIONS AND DECLARATIONS RENDERED BY THE INTER- NATIONAL COMMISSION ON ZOOLOGICAL NOMENCLATURE

Edited by

FRANCIS HEMMING, C.M.G., C.B.E.

Secretary to the Commission

VOLUME 8. Part 13. Pp. 167—178

OPINION 296

Suppression, under the Plenary Powers, for nomenclatorial purposes, of volume 3 (*Regnum Lapidum*) of the Twelfth Edition of the *Systema Naturae* of Linnaeus published in 1768 and of the corresponding volume in the Houttuyn (1785), Gmelin (1793) and Turton (1806) editions of the above work.



LONDON :

Printed by Order of the International Trust for
Zoological Nomenclature
and

Sold on behalf of the International Commission on Zoological
Nomenclature by the International Trust at its Publications Office
41, Queen's Gate, London, S.W.7
1954

Price Six Shillings

(All rights reserved)

INTERNATIONAL COMMISSION ON ZOOLOGICAL NOMENCLATURE

COMPOSITION AT THE TIME OF THE ADOPTION OF THE RULING GIVEN IN OPINION 296

A. The Officers of the Commission

Honorary Life President : Dr. Karl Jordan (*British Museum (Natural History), Zoological Museum, Tring, Herts., England*).

President : (Vacant).

Vice-President : Senhor Dr. Afranio do Amaral (*Sao Paulo, Brazil*).

Secretary : Mr. Francis Hemming (*London, England*).

B. The Members of the Commission

(arranged in order of precedence by reference to date of election or of most recent re-election, as prescribed by the International Congress of Zoology).

Senhor Dr. Afranio do AMARAL (*S. Paulo, Brazil*) (*Vice-President*) (1st January 1944).

Professor J. R. DYMOND (*University of Toronto, Toronto, Canada*) (1st January 1944).

Professor J. Chester BRADLEY (*Cornell University, Ithaca, N.Y., U.S.A.*) (28th March 1944).

Professor Harold E. VOKES (*Johns Hopkins University, Baltimore, Maryland, U.S.A.*) (23rd April 1944).

Dr. William Thomas CALMAN (*Coulsdon, Surrey, England*) (1st January 1947).

Professor Béla HANKÓ (*Békéscsaba, Hungary*) (1st January 1947).

Dr. Norman R. STOLL (*Rockefeller Institute for Medical Research, New York, N.Y., U.S.A.*) (1st January 1947).

Professor H. BOSCHMA (*Rijksmuseum van Natuurlijke Historie, Leiden, The Netherlands*) (1st January 1947).

Senor Dr. Angel CABRERA (*Eva Peron, F.C.N.G.R., Argentina*) (27th July 1948).

Mr. Francis HEMMING (*London, England*) (*Secretary*) (27th July 1948).

Dr. Joseph PEARSON (*Tasmanian Museum, Hobart, Tasmania, Australia*) (27th July 1948).

Dr. Henning LEMCHE (*Universitetets Zoologiske Museum, Copenhagen, Denmark*) (27th July 1948).

Professor Teiso ESAKI (*Kyushu University, Fukuoka, Japan*) (17th April 1950).

Professor Pierre BONNET (*Université de Toulouse, France*) (9th June 1950).

Mr. Norman Denbigh RILEY (*British Museum (Natural History), London*) (9th June 1950).

Professor Tadeusz JACZEWSKI (*Department of Systematic Zoology, Warsaw University, Warsaw, Poland*) (15th June 1950).

Professor Robert MERTENS (*Natur-Museum u. Forschungs-Institut Senckenberg, Frankfurt a. M., Germany*) (5th July 1950).

Professor Erich Martin HERING (*Zoologisches Museum der Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin, Germany*) (5th July 1950).

OPINION 296

SUPPRESSION, UNDER THE PLENARY POWERS, FOR
NOMENCLATORIAL PURPOSES, OF VOLUME 3
("REGNUM LAPIDEUM") OF THE TWELFTH
EDITION OF THE "SYSTEMA NATURAE" OF
LINNAEUS PUBLISHED IN 1768 AND OF
THE CORRESPONDING VOLUME IN
THE HOUTTUYN (1785), GMELIN
(1793) AND TURTON (1806)
EDITIONS OF THE
ABOVE WORK

RULING :—(1) Under the Plenary Powers, the volumes specified below of the under-mentioned works are hereby suppressed for nomenclatorial purposes :—
(a) Linnaeus, 1768, *Systema Naturae* (12th Edition), volume 3 (*Regnum Lapideum*) ; (b) Houttuyn (M.), 1785, *Natuurlyke Historie*, volume 3 ; (c) Gmelin (J.F.), 1793, Linnaeus, *Systema Naturae* (13th Edition), volume 3 ; (d) Turton (W.), 1806, *A General System of Nature* . . . Charles Linné, volume 7.

(2) The volumes suppressed for nomenclatorial purposes, under the Plenary Powers, in (1) above, of the four editions of the *Systema Naturae* there specified are hereby placed on the *Official Index of Rejected and Invalid Works in Zoological Nomenclature* as Works Nos. 17 to 20 respectively.

I.—THE STATEMENT OF THE CASE

On 10th March 1949, Mr. R. Winckworth (*London*) submitted the following application for the suppression, under the Plenary Powers, of the names of fossils published in 1768 in volume 3 (*Regnum Lapideum*) of the 12th Edition of the *Systema Naturae*

of Linnaeus and of the corresponding volumes in three later editions of the same work :—

Proposed use of the Plenary Powers to suppress certain names published for fossil animals by Linnaeus in 1768 and by other authors in later editions of the works of Linnaeus

By R. WINCKWORTH
(London)

The twelfth edition of Linnaeus' *Systema Naturae* includes a third volume "Regnum Lapideum", published in 1768. Part of this (pages 153—174) treats of Petrificata and contains a number of binominal names for fossil animals. If, however, an attempt is made to use these names, confusion at once arises : for the generic names correspond to the classes, not to the genera, of the first volume, e.g., *Zoolithus* is the fossil genus equivalent to Mammalia, and *Helmintholithus* to Vermes. The trivial names may correspond to species or to groups of species or to genera. Thus, *Helmintholithus Hammonites* contains four general references and nine further (lettered) references, which are stated to be "totidem distinctae species" : *Helmintholithus Anomites* contains references to eleven species of *Anomia* named in volume 1 : *Helmintholithus Gryphites* is the same as *Anomia Gryphus* of volume 1. It seems difficult to apply these names of fossils without introducing confusion. Application is hereby made to the Commission to suppress the names introduced in Linnaeus, 1768, *Systema Naturae*, (ed. 12) 3 : 153—174, and also in such other works as are later editions of, or amplifications based on, this volume of the *Systema*.

2. In particular the suppression should apply to :—

Linnaeus, 1768, *Systema Naturae*, (ed. 12) 3

J. F. Gmelin, 1793, *Systema Naturae*, (ed. 13) 3

M. Houttuyn, 1785, *Natuurlyke Historie*, 3

W. Turton, 1806, *A general System of Nature*, 7

3. This application has the unanimous support of the Nomenclature Committee of the Malacological Society of London.

II.—THE SUBSEQUENT HISTORY OF THE CASE

2. *Registration of the present application*: On receipt in March 1949 of Mr. Winckworth's application, the problem presented

by the names given to fossils in the volume of the 12th Edition of the *Systema Naturae* devoted to minerals was given the Registered Number Z.N.(S.) 418.

3. *Application submitted independently by Dr. Thomas W. Amsden (The Johns Hopkins University, Baltimore, Maryland, U.S.A.):* On 28th November 1949, Dr. Thomas W. Amsden (*The Johns Hopkins University, Department of Geology, Baltimore, Maryland, U.S.A.*), who was not aware of the proposals submitted to the International Commission by Mr. Winckworth, independently submitted the following request for a ruling on the question of the availability of the names published in the volume referred to above :—

Question on the status of names used in the “*Systema Naturae*”,
Edition 12, volume 3, 1768 ; with special reference to the
term “*Conchidium*”

By THOMAS W. AMSDEN

(*The Johns Hopkins University, Department of Geology, Baltimore, Maryland, U.S.A.*)

I wish to have an *Opinion* on the status of the names used by Linnaeus in his *Systema Naturae*, edition 12, volume 3, 1768. I am especially interested in the terms *Helmintholithus*, *Conchidium* and *bilocularis* as used on pages 162—163.

2. *Helmintholithus* was used as a major heading or group followed by the descriptive phrase “*Petrificatum vermis*”. The name *Conchidium* was placed by Linnaeus under *Helmintholithus* along with a number of other names such as *Hammonites* and *Anomites*. After the word *Conchidium* is a string of terms, “*Helminthol. Patellae? bilocularis. Conchidium*” followed by a reference to his *Museum Tessinianum* of 1753.

3. In the years following the publication of this work these names were given different interpretations by different authors. Hisinger in 1799 (*Minerographiske anmärkningar öfver Gottland* : 285) used *bilocularis* as a species, placing it in the genus *Anomia*. Hisinger’s usage as quoted in St. Joseph (1937, *Norsk Geolisk Tidsskift*, 17 : 260) (I have not seen the original paper) is as follows :

Anomia bilocularis testa obovata multisulcata, nate incurvata : valva longiore sepimento longitudinali in duo loculamenta divisa.

Finnes vid Klinteberg til myckenhet med och utan hopsittande parskal, och är den samma hvars ena skal i Syst. Nat. T. III, 101. 33B blifvit räknad til *Helminth. Patellaria. Conchidium*.

4. It would appear from this that Hisinger was referring to the same form as Linnaeus.

5. On the other hand, Wahlenberg (1819, *Nova Acta Soc. Sci. Upsal*, 8 : 67) regarded *conchidium* of Linnaeus as a species in the genus *Anomites* (*A. bilocularis* of Hisinger was listed as a synonym). Dalman (1828, *K. Svenska Vetensk. Akad. Handl.*, for 1827 : 125) also regarded *conchidium* as a species and placed it in the new genus *Gypidia*. This usage was followed by Davidson in 1853 (*British Fossil Brachiopoda* 1 : 99) who placed *conchidium* as a species in Sowerby's genus *Pentamerus*.

6. Sherborn (1902, *Index Animalium*, 1758—1800 : 236) was apparently uncertain as to the status of *conchidium* as he refers to it as "conchidium Helmintholithus". He lists *Helmintholithus* on page 453 of this volume with a note stating "The Helmintholithi are referred to in groups, e.g. *H. lepadis*, *H. veneris* and are therefore not quoted". On page 1125 he gives "' Helmintholithus ' . . . conchidium."

6. In later years *Conchidium* has come to be regarded as a genus with *bilocularis* as the type species (e.g. Hall and Clarke 1894, *Paleontology* volume 8, part 2, p. 233 ; Schuchert and Cooper 1932, *Mem. Peabody Museum of Natural History*, 4 : 181).

8. St. Joseph in 1937 (*Norsk Geologiske Tidsskrift*, 17 : 258—261) discussed the problem at some length and concluded that Linnaeus had used these names in a trinomial sense and hence they were invalid. He decided, however, that the generic name *Conchidium* and the specific name *bilocularis* were correctly used by Hisinger in 1799 (see above) and could therefore be retained but should be credited to this author. It appears to me that Hisinger's usage of *bilocularis* is clear enough but the manner in which *Conchidium* is employed would seem to be equivocal.

9. In view of these uncertainties, I would like to propose the following questions :

- (1) Are the organic names used in the *Systema Naturae*, edition 12, vol. 3 valid ?
- (2) If these names are valid, what is the status of the terms *Helmintholithus*, *Conchidium* and *bilocularis* ? Is *Helmintholithus* or *Conchidium* the generic name ? If *Conchidium* is the generic

name, is *bilocularis* the specific name, or is this merely a description phrase and *Conchidium* a genus without species?

- (3) In the event that these names are invalid, is *Conchidium* of Hisinger, 1799, available as a generic name?

4. Publication of the present application: At the time of the receipt of the applications submitted by Mr. Winckworth and Dr. Amsden, the entire resources of the International Commission were concentrated upon the preparation and publication, in the *Bulletin of Zoological Nomenclature*, of the Official Records of the Session held by the Commission at Paris in 1948. It was not until the autumn of 1950 that it was possible to resume preparations for the publication in the *Bulletin* of applications relating to individual nomenclatorial cases submitted to the Commission for decision. Mr. Winckworth's application was sent to the printer in December 1950, and was published in Part 3 of volume 2 of the *Bulletin* on 20th April 1951 (Winckworth, 1951, *Bull. zool. Nomencl.* 2 : 88).

5. Issue of Public Notices: Under the revised arrangements approved by the Thirteenth International Congress of Zoology, Paris, 1948 (1950, *Bull. zool. Nomencl.* 4 : 51—56), Public Notice of the possible use by the International Commission on Zoological Nomenclature of its Plenary Powers in the present case was given on 20th April 1952, both in Part 3 of volume 2 of the *Bulletin of Zoological Nomenclature*, the Part in which Mr. Winckworth's application was published, and also to the other prescribed serial publications. In addition, Notice was given to certain other serial publications likely to be interested in this application. The publication of these Notices elicited no objection to the action proposed.

6. Support received for Mr. Winckworth's application: In addition to the support unanimously tendered by the Malacological Society of London (paragraph 1), support for the present application was received from the following specialists:— (a) Dr. F. Elizabeth S. Alexander (*Sedgwick Museum, Cambridge University, Cambridge*); (b) Professor Dr. Rudolf Richter (*Natur-Museum u. Forschungs-Institut Senckenberg, Senckenberg-Anlage, Frankfurt a.M., Germany*); (c) Dr. Joshua L. Baily, Jr. (*San Diego, California, U.S.A.*); (d) Mr. Leslie Bairstow (*British*

Museum (Natural History), London) ; (e) The Joint Committee on Zoological Nomenclature for Paleontology in America. The communications so received are given in the immediately following paragraphs.

7. *Support received from Dr. F. Elizabeth S. Alexander (Sedgwick Museum, Cambridge University, Cambridge)*: In submitting an application to the Commission on the names *Conchidium* and *Pentamerus*, Dr. F. Elizabeth Alexander (*Sedgwick Museum, Cambridge University, Cambridge*) had occasion to refer to the use of the name *Conchidium* by Linnaeus in volume 3 of the 12th edition of the *Systema Naturae* and in this connection submitted the following statement of support for Mr. Winckworth's application for the suppression for nomenclatorial purposes of the foregoing volume (Alexander, 1951, *Bull. zool. Nomencl.* 2 : 89)¹:—

I understand that Mr. R. Winckworth submitted an application supported by the Nomenclature Committee of the Malacological Society of London, asking the Commission to remove all doubts regarding the availability of names published in this volume [volume 3 of Linnaeus, 1768, *Syst. Nat.* (ed. 12)] by suppressing it for nomenclatorial purposes (Commission's File Z.N.(S.) 418). I feel strongly that this course is desirable, since until this is done, confusion is bound to arise, at least as far as the Brachiopoda are concerned.

8. *Support received from Professor Dr. Rudolf Richter (Natur-Museum u. Forschungs-Institute Senckenberg, Seckenberg-Anlage, Frankfurt a.M., Germany)*: In a letter dated 30th May 1951 (transmitted by Professor Dr. Robert Mertens, with a large number of comments on other cases, under cover of a letter dated 27th August 1951) from which the following is an extract, Professor Dr. Rudolf Richter (*Natur-Museum u. Forschungs-Institut, Senckenberg, Senckenberg-Anlage, Frankfurt a.M.*) gave his support to Mr. Winckworth's application (Richter, 1952, *Bull. zool. Nomencl.* 6 : 213):—Der Vorschlag, die Namen zu unterdrücken ist zweckmässig.

¹ The passage here quoted was inserted by Dr. Alexander in her revised application dated 10th October 1950 in regard to the generic name *Conchidium*. For the decision of the Commission in regard to that name see *Opinion* 297.

9. *Support received from Dr. Joshua L. Baily, Jr. (San Diego, California, U.S.A.):* In a letter dated 22nd June 1951 (concerned mainly with other matters), Dr. Joshua L. Baily, Jr. (*San Diego, California, U.S.A.*) wrote as follows as regards the present case : " Z.N.(S.) 418 : I am in complete agreement with this proposal, although I am not familiar with the work in question ".

10. *Support received from Mr. Leslie Bairstow (British Museum (Natural History), London):* In a letter dated 23rd August 1951, Mr. Leslie Bairstow (*British Museum (Natural History), London*) indicated as follows his support for Mr. Winckworth's proposal (Bairstow, 1952, *Bull. zool. Nomencl.* 6 : 213):—

I strongly support the proposal in regard to the above matter submitted to the International Commission on Zoological Nomenclature by Mr. R. Winckworth (1951, *Bull. zool. Nomencl.* 2 : 88), for I have had in mind for eighteen years the desirability of the suppression of the names for fossil animals introduced in the *Systema Naturae*, *Regnum Lapideum*, by Linnaeus, 1768, and Gmelin, 1793.

11. *Support received from the Joint Committee on Zoological Nomenclature for Paleontology in America:* On 9th April 1952 there was received in the Office of the Commission a large number of letters from Professor G. Winston Sinclair (then of the *University of Michigan, Ann Arbor, Michigan, U.S.A.*), Chairman of the Joint Committee on Zoological Nomenclature for Paleontology in America, submitting statements of the views of the members of the Committee on applications published in the *Bulletin of Zoological Nomenclature*. It appeared that the despatch of these letters had been held back by Professor Sinclair until he was in a position to send the entire set to the Commission, and it was presumably on this account that the letter relating to the present case, though dated 6th February 1952, was not received until 9th April. By that time the Prescribed Period of Notice had expired, and the Voting Paper (V.P.(52)13) relating to the present case had already been prepared. It was therefore impossible to include in that Voting Paper a reference to Professor Sinclair's letter, but, when a few days later the Voting Paper was despatched (15th April), a supplementary sheet containing the particulars included in Professor Sinclair's letter was issued to the Members of the Commission, who were thus placed in possession of the

views of the Joint Committee at the same time that they received the Voting Paper relating to the present case. The following is the text of Professor Sinclair's letter :—

The Joint Committee on Zoological Nomenclature for Paleontology in America has considered this subject, and I wish to inform you that, being polled, they voted :

To support the petition (9)

Don L. Frizzell
Bobb Schaeffer
Katherine V. W. Palmer
Bryan Patterson
Siemon W. Muller
A. Myra Keen
John B. Reeside, Jr.
John W. Wells
G. Winston Sinclair

III.—THE DECISION OF THE INTERNATIONAL COMMISSION ON ZOOLOGICAL NOMENCLATURE

12. *Issue of Voting Paper V.P.(52)13 :* On 15th April 1952, a Voting Paper (V.P.(52)13) was issued in which the Members of the Commission were invited to vote either for, or against, the proposal "relating to the suppression, for nomenclatorial purposes, of the four volumes specified in the penultimate paragraph on page 88 of volume 2 of the *Bulletin of Zoological Nomenclature*" [i.e. paragraph 2 of the application reproduced in the first paragraph of the present *Opinion*].

13. *The Prescribed Voting Period:* As the foregoing Voting Paper was issued under the Three-Month Rule, the prescribed Voting Period closed on 15th July 1952.

14. *Particulars of the Voting on Voting Paper V.P.(52)13* : The state of the voting on Voting Paper V.P.(52)13 at the close of the prescribed Voting Period was as follows :—

(a) *Affirmative Votes had been given by the following seventeen (17) Commissioners (arranged in the order in which Votes were received)*:

Hering ; Calman ; Riley ; Dymond ; Esaki ; Pearson ; do Amaral ; Hankó ; Bonnet ; Lemche ; Vokes ; Cabrera ; Boschma ; Stoll ; Bradley ; Mertens ; Hemming ;

(b) *Negative Votes*:

None ;

(c) *Voting Paper V.P. (52)13 was not returned by one (1) Commissioner*:

Jaczewski.

15. *Declaration of Result of Vote* : On 16th July 1952, Mr. Hemming, Secretary to the International Commission, acting as Returning Officer for the Vote taken on Voting Paper V.P.(52)13, signed a Certificate that the Votes cast were as set out in paragraph 14 above and declaring that the proposal submitted in the foregoing Voting Paper had been duly adopted and that the decision so taken was the decision of the International Commission in the matter aforesaid.

16. At its meeting held at Copenhagen in August 1953, the Fourteenth International Congress of Zoology decided to insert a provision in the *Règles* establishing an " Official Index " to be styled the *Official Index of Rejected and Invalid Works in Zoological Nomenclature*, and directing the insertion therein of the title of any work or part of a work which the International Commission might either reject under its Plenary Powers or declare to be invalid for the purposes of zoological nomenclature (1953, *Copenhagen Decisions zool. Nomencl.* : 23—24). Since the foregoing decisions apply to past, as well as to future, decisions

by the International Commission in cases of this kind, the opportunity presented by the preparation of the present *Opinion* has been taken to record the insertion in the foregoing *Official Index* of entries relating to the four volumes suppressed under the Plenary Powers in the Ruling given in the present *Opinion*.

17. On 6th March 1954, Mr. Hemming prepared the Ruling given in the present *Opinion* and at the same time signed a Certificate that the terms of that Ruling were in complete accord with those of the proposal approved by the International Commission in its Vote on Voting Paper V.P.(52)13, as supplemented by the action taken under the General Directive issued to the Commission by the International Congress of Zoology, as specified in paragraph 16 above.

18. The prescribed procedures were duly complied with by the International Commission on Zoological Nomenclature in dealing with the present case, and the present *Opinion* is accordingly hereby rendered in the name of the said International Commission by the under-signed Francis Hemming, Secretary to the International Commission on Zoological Nomenclature, in virtue of all and every the powers conferred upon him in that behalf.

19. The present *Opinion* shall be known as *Opinion* Two Hundred and Ninety-Six (296) of the International Commission on Zoological Nomenclature.

DONE in London, this Seventh day of March, Nineteen Hundred and Fifty-Four.

*Secretary to the International Commission
on Zoological Nomenclature*

FRANCIS HEMMING